Palestinian Experiences of Loss of the Land and Displacement: An Ethnographic Phenomenological Analysis

Yasmin Snounu

This paper focuses on the experiences of the Palestinian refugees who are living in the United States of America (U.S.). Thousands of Palestinians in the U.S. attained American citizenship through asylum, and others were born in the U.S. For the sake of this paper, an ethnographicalphenomenological methodology is used through interviewing and observing three Palestinian refugees from Michigan about their experiences of displacement. Participants discussed ways in which they construct meaning out of their experiences living in the U.S. away from Palestine.

Orfalea (2006) indicated that there are 250,000 Palestinian Americans in the United States, which raises questions on how those Palestinians reflect on their identity, and their life in the U.S. It is crucial to study such a topic because it is part of the Palestinian history, memory and homeland. Raising awareness and uncovering what it means to be a refugee, forced to leave their land, is worth searching and looking into in more depth into experiences of Palestinian refugees. Especially it is empirical to advocate for those people who were obligated to leave their country and were deprived of their right to be in their home country like the case of the Palestinians.

In Palestine, social injustice is manifested in many aspects, one of which is what Hysom and El Sarraj (2012) called “the Urban Displacement.” The term social injustice emerges in discussions about Palestine, the Palestinians’ experiences of land loss, and living under the Israeli occupation. For instance, in the Gaza Strip, there are over 1.8 million Palestinians living in only 365km²; 68.4% of the population in Gaza consists of refugees (UNDP’s Programme of Assistance to the Palestinian People, 2015). Those refugees fled to neighboring Arab countries and the cities of Gaza and the West Bank from their original cities of Yafa, Haifa, and Jerusalem, during the Israeli ethnic cleansing of Palestine in 1948 (Pappé, 2006). Palestinians did not choose to leave; rather the armed Zionists represented in Haganah Groups forced them (Pappé, 2006). Thousands of Palestinian refugees continue to live in Gaza and are now an inseparable component of the society in the Gaza Strip (Hysom & El Sarraj, 2012).

Israel has created a system with policies that not only exclude the Palestinians from enjoying their rights as indigenous people of the land, but also oppresses them by placing them in an inferior position compared to the Israelis. The U. S. President Carter (2006) stated that Israel became more militarized and described in detail the mechanisms for making the Palestinians’ lives unbearable, besides the ongoing confiscation of 18% of the internationally recognized Palestinian land after UN partition plan gave the Israelis 82% of this land. This pushes more Palestinians to leave their homes as refugees to other areas, especially to the U.S.

A system of unequal classes creates forms of control, deepens inequality, and eliminates forms of freedom. Such a system of Palestinians from the time Israel was established in 1948 until the present, despite continual efforts to mitigate the conflict. As Carter (2006) and Bennis (2009) showed, the Oslo agreement, which was signed between the Israelis and the Palestinians under American mediation, gave very little authority to the Palestinian leadership, and thus it established a new form of control in terms of giving the Israelis more freedom to establish complete jurisdiction over Gaza and the West Bank. Carter (2006) insisted that the Oslo agreement gave the Israeli army more freedom to exercise hegemony within the Occupied Palestinian Territories.

It is apparent that in such an Israeli structural system of elimination, exclusion, and discrimination, many institutions and individuals have turned their attention towards the Palestinian reality; i.e., the meaning of experiencing social injustice, daily attacks, and death, as well as the impact of the Israeli apartheid system on the Palestinians. According to Allison Weir, of the website “If Americans Knew” (2014), the UN condemned Israel through 77 UN resolutions, and the Palestinians with only 1. The refugee problem in this context has been a prominent issue in the agenda of the Palestinian struggle. This study will examine the relocation experiences of three Palestinian refugees, now in the United States, and how they presently connect their lives and experiences to the current Palestinian struggle.

Methodology

A qualitative approach is the best fit for this study, as Glesne (2005) confirmed that such an approach leads to identifying meaning, which is formed through lively experiences. The qualitative approach enables my...
participants, as case study of three participants, to express their voices, and their experiences give the reader an idea of what it means to be expelled from one’s land and coerced to live in a different place. Similarly, Spradley (1979) confirmed that ethnography is all about “learning from people rather than studying people” (p.3), thus I was able to learn more about what it means to be a Palestinian refugee. Phenomenology, on the other hand, is the method where participants “reconstruct and reflect on their lived experiences…to search again for the essence of their lived experience” (Seidman, 2013, p.17). This paper uses both phenomenological and ethnographic approaches to construct/understand the meaning of those refugees’ experiences as extracted from their verbatim input, as well as observations made about their own spaces where they live in relation to their lives as refugees.

The interviews conducted were an hour each, using open-ended questions. Interviews were recorded and transcribed, and eventually analyzed to find narrative themes. There were specific criteria for choosing interviewees for this study. The interviewees were all Palestinians who were born in Palestine, and who left the historical Palestine, with their families, either in 1948, when the establishment of the state of Israel and the process of ethnic cleansing of Palestine took place around that time. I also observed the participants as I visited them in their homes.I chose those who were born in Palestine in order to highlight their experiences of loss of the land and displacement.

Positionality

As a child I grew up hearing the stories of displacement as my grandmother was from Yafa (which is now part of the State of Israel). My maternal grandmother was expelled with her family from Yafa when she was five years old. I was born and raised in Gaza, where most of the people there are refugees expelled from their original cities in the historical Palestine. It has always been a passion for me to learn more about the experiences of those refugees, how they feel, how being refugees impacted their lives and why this is important.

Although I am Palestinian doing a research on a topic that is part of identity, but this study focuses on the voices of my participants. I was born and raised in Gaza, where I have many friends who are Palestinian refugees of 1948 and 1967, since most of the Gazan population are refugees. Nevertheless, this study contributed to provide me with another perspective on how those Palestinians living in the U.S. experience the loss of their land. I sought to understand how those Palestinian refugees in the U.S. make meaning of their lives as refugees and to hear about what it feels like to be a refugee. For the sake of this study, I included a section on positionality addressing challenges I face while conducting the study.

Confidentiality and protection

For this study, I received approval to conduct this research from Eastern Michigan University’s Human Subjects Research Committee (UHSRC) in Fall 2015. Participants were asked to sign a consent form. The consent form included clear guidelines to ensure participants were protected. I conducted and audio recorded the interviews in a mutually agreed upon space and transcribed them. The audio recordings and field notes were kept in my possession at all times. Pseudonyms were chosen for the participants and any other names mentioned during the interviews to protect anonymity.

Thematic Narrative Analysis

To be a refugee is to experience things in life differently. These experiences reflect strengths, struggles, barriers, and negative and positive impacts on the lives of refugees. They may reflect struggle mixed with determination and connection to the homeland, as it is clear in the three narratives of Gabriel, Joe, and Eva. The three narratives unfold conflicting themes around their experiences of being refugees in the United States. The three experiential narratives provide contradictory themes when comparing them to each other. The themes presented in this paper are as follows: Sense of struggle and suffering, sense of resilience and survival, sense of patriotism/connection and belonging to the homeland, and sense of dismay and anger.

Participant Profiles

1. Gabriel is a Christian Palestinian American who lives in Detroit, Michigan. He was born in Jerusalem in 1942, he lived in Yafa, a coastal city in the North of Palestine, till age six when the Israelis forced him and his family to leave under the fire of the soldiers. Gabriel states, “When the Zionists attacked Yafa, . . . we had to leave whether we like it or not because under the gun.” Gabriel and his family left Birzeit, a city in the West Bank, and later they went to Jordan. When Gabriel finished high school, he applied to study in the U.S., and he was accepted, so he has been in the U.S since his early twenties, experiencing a life of a Palestinian refugee.

2. Joe is a Christian Palestinian American who lives in Pinckney, Michigan. He was born in Haifa in 1935 and lived in Haifa till he was 12 years old, when he and his family moved to the U.S. He has spent the rest of his life in the United States.
3. Eva is a Christian Palestinian refugee who is 84. She was born in 1930 in Beitjala in Beitlahem. She got married at age sixteen, and she had to move with her husband to Gaza because of security reasons. Later, she and her family moved to the United States, where she pursued her education in the U.S. while taking care of her children and became a social worker later. She is now a retired social worker.

**Sense of Struggle/Suffering**

Home countries should be a safe haven for their citizens; however, political reality shapes many experiences of people, and many become refugees, where they have to leave for a different place, running with their lives to a safe haven. In the process, they go through hardships and struggle to make meaning of their lives. In the case of Gabriel, he and his family experienced a lot of agony due to displacement and moving from one place to another. Gabriel was six years old when Israel took over his city, Yafa, he says, “we lost everything in Yafa, all the possessions and everything and the house… in 1948… I was six.” Upon this loss, Gabriel and his family consisted of his mother and another five children had to move to Birzeit in the West Bank, as his father was in Iraq making a living. While going through moments that threatened their lives, Gabriel and his family struggled against death along with other Palestinians who lived there with them, as he tells:

When the Zionists attacked Yafa… We had to leave whether we liked it or not because under the gun. So, the men run away into the sea, from the sea to Gaza and the women and children, they were put in trucks or whatever is available. Even if a guy has a car, they grab him and put people in it, and they tell him to go east. So, what happened to our house, it was even shot with bullets. We had to go under the bed.

After Gabriel and his family ran to escape death, their journey of displacement and homelessness started in Birzeit in the West Bank where their father joined them, but they did not have a house, they did not have jobs. They had nothing but his mother’s gold, which made them very vulnerable to different circumstances of statelessness. He describes, “we left to Birzeit, and there were no jobs, and we suffered quite a bit because my mom sold whatever jewelry she had at that time. Now imagine that the woman was a typical modern city woman, with even make-up. Overnight, we have no place to go to a bathroom. Overnight.”

Gabriel also struggled with the biased educational system in the United States, where he experienced a system of discrimination while applying schools in the U.S., which placed Gabriel in a powerless position with no choice with feelings of agony and helplessness. Gabriel tells, “But one thing they did not accept me for medicine … they said you are a foreign student, you cannot do pre medicine, yet the Israeli students were accepted…”

Joe’s family had different experiences of struggling coming to the U.S. Joe’s family had American citizenship which his father applied for when he was working in the U.S. However, when Joe and his family were forced to move from Palestine, he had a sister who did not have the American citizenship, and thus she was denied to enter the U.S, which made him and his family powerless as Joe tells: “At Ellis Island, they gave her a hard time because she wasn’t registered as American. They said you can go but the baby can’t. He said or you can go back home, she said we have no home we are refugees.” Joe and his family experienced being homeless everywhere even at the borders of the U.S.

Education was another struggle for Joe. Although he demonstrated resilience when working while going to school to help his family, he could not finish college the first time he registered because of his living conditions that added burdens on him to the extent that he could not do both work and go to college. He explains, “I realized I was burnt out by the time finished high school. I tried to go to college. I sign up at Wayne, it wasn't Wayne State at the time it was Wayne University before it became a state school. So, I applied there but I just dropped out of classes. I was falling asleep during the classes. I just wasn't able to do it.”

As for Eva, she and her family struggled moving from one place to another, first moving to Gaza, where her husband had to leave her so many times for long periods of time alone with her children so he could make a living. Her suffering was also apparent through the fear and horror she lived in while the Israelis were committing massacres in Palestine. Hearing the stories of her neighboring villages made her frantic and terrified; she was about to tear when she told about these events:

In 1948, I saw people running from surrounding villages, my parents’ house on the streets and have balcony, and people running from neighboring villages, carrying their children on their back... In groups. I heard a story, that one woman she was scared she carried the pillow instead of her child, it is a very painful story... When they were hitting Palestine at that time, the Israelis... We see the plane in front of us. We thought this was the Arabs, and I was scared that that, because I have three beautiful daughters, you see them here. We were scared.
**Sense of Patriotism/Connection and Belonging to the Homeland**

Observing the houses of both Joe and Eva, here in the U.S., gave insights on how deep those Palestinian refugees associated themselves with their home country Palestine. At Joe’s front door, there were signs saying, “War is not the answer,” and the Palestinian flag was at the door as well. Once entering the house, there were pictures of Joe wearing the Palestinian flag and the Palestinian scarf known as Kuffiya, which is a symbol of the Palestinian resistance and cause. Other pictures while he was visiting Gaza, and Palestinian crafts were everywhere in his house, such as key chains, embroidered pieces hanged on the wall of the living room, and pictures of his family from Palestine.

In fact he started the interview by giving me articles he wrote on Palestine, and he gave me other brochures that showed his activities for Palestine, while handing me those articles, he explains, “this is when I came back from Gaza, I been to Gaza about three times and this is one of the times I go to protest nuclear bombs, I go to protest this is in Oakridge, Tennessee where they first manufactured Nuclear weapons during world war II.” Joe felt a strong connection to his homeland Palestine and what happened to him and his family, and thus decided to extend his activities in support to other people as a result of his connection to his homeland.

Joe had always that sense of attachment to Palestine as he confirmed that was his identity, and he always aspired to live there, he emphasizes, “my identity is Palestinian. I am proud of that and I have no qualms about that even though I am American. . .I always had this sense of pride of being Palestinian. . .I would go there every year if I could, I would live there if I could. . .I advocate for humanity, and Palestine is part of that humanity.”

Similarly, Eva’s living room was full of Palestinian embroidered pillows, pictures of her daughter who lives now in Beitlahem wearing and making Palestinian dresses, and pieces of art showing Palestinian women picking oranges during the harvest season in Palestine. Elaine had also a huge picture of her family tree hanged on the wall in her living room. All these objects from both houses showed the deep connection and belonging both Joe and Eva have for their original country despite the fact that they both have lived in America for years and years as both are in their eighties. In fact, both started the conversation with me by showing me these pieces and handing them to me and explaining that they are part of their identity that will always be with them and that they have passed them on to their children.

Eva showed ambivalent feelings when it comes to her connection to her homeland because of the current political instability over there. On one hand, she kept beautiful memories from the past before Israel was created as she describes it: “It was really beautiful life in Palestine, the weather is beautiful, people are happy. . .It was very pleasant time.” On the other hand, Eva experienced other emotions that were negative thinking about her daughter who decided to live in Beitlahem, so Eva feared for her daughter’s life, the matter that made her worry and think about her daughter, Eva describes her worries: “It was very hard, because I have a daughter there, I was worried all the time.”

**Sense of Resilience and Survival**

To be displaced and forced to leave your home places people in a position of vulnerability, where refugees have to cope with their new life and deal with challenges. The three Palestinian refugees interviewed in this paper showed a great deal of resilience as refugees. Although they all went through different agonies trying to find another home, they showed resilience and strength when facing the challenges of displacement and land loss. Gabriel’s mother, for instance, showed resilience in an attempt to save her children, keep them safe, and make sure they survive, Gabriel recalls, “my mother gave the guy who had a car some of her jewelry. She had it stuck in her bra. . .During the night, my brother made pockets and she put money in each pocket and then she hooked it with thread under underneath our under wears, the boys and the girls and she said if we get separated, you have some money, so you can manage.”

Making a living for Gabriel and his family became a struggle, however, his mother strategized her methods to feed her children in Birzeit, the West Bank. Gabriel explains some of his mother’s resilience strategies: “Mymom had us, the boys, to go out and hunt the birds, we had to hunt birds for meat. . .She bought things like hummus and she made balila (boiled chickpeas with cumin), . . .and she put it in a newspaper, and we used to sell it in coffee houses and make pennies.” It is clear that George’s mother tries to find a way to survive with her children through making food and selling it.

Joe, on the other hand, had to take care of his family and to make a living in the U.S. because his father died when he was at age sixteen; he demonstrated resilience through making a living so his mother and sisters could survive, while he was going to school too for education, Joe describes the journey:

When I turned 14, I started to work at the Western Union. Back then they had telegrams and I would go to work at 4 o’clock in the afternoon till 10 o’clock. . . As soon as I turned 16 my father took me to the
police station, got my driver’s license and four months later just died. . . I was 16 so I lied about my age and told them I was 18. I got his job at Ford Motor Company I went to work midnights at Ford Motor and went to high school during the day.

After Joe finished high school, he was not able to go to college and work at the same time, however, he managed to go back to school and earn high degrees, as he confirms,

when I first came out the air force my partner stole the business from me. That’s when I decide to go back to College. So, I went to Wayne State and I got my bachelor’s in political science and I got my master’s in international relations. Then when I was 42, I went back and got another master.

This presents how persistent and resilient Joe was in achieving his academic goals under hardships.

Eva’s resilience as a refugee throughout her life wasmanifested in many aspects, her strength at times of hardships during the exodus time in 1948 was one; another aspect was her determination to go to school. She describes in detail:

We have a big house in Beitjala. All the neighbors, we have a basement in our house, and all the neighbors, 40 people, they were women and children, in our basement and we were sitting all like this. We can’t sleep because it can’t hold 40 people sleeping, and I was rushing to the house when the planes were over us. I bring some food for the people and feed them, whatever I have.

Eva never gave up on education, she always desired to have a degree and help people, and her resilience as a refugee and determination contributed to her success in getting her Master’s Degree in Social Science from the University of Michigan, while working as a wife taking care of her husband and her children, and going to school at the same time, which was very challenging for her, but she was determined, she tells:

I went to WCC, I told them I did not have a degree. I did not have high school degree but I’m eager to learn and they accepted me. . . I kept serving food, grape leaves, baklava, inviting people while I am going to school, and I stayed until 3 o’clock in the morning to finish my schoolwork. . . I was on the honor list twice. That helped to go to the University of Michigan, and then I started undergrad and got my master’s in social work in 1981.

**Sense of Dismay and Anger**

Unlike Eva, both Gabriel and Joe showed dismay and anger when telling parts of their stories and their experiences here in the United States. They were either upset about the system of the country or about individuals’ and organizations’ attitudes towards the Palestinians and the Palestinian cause. Gabriel, for instance, was allowed to stay in the United States after he finished his studies in construction management because of war in 1967, where he started working in a company, but was very dismayed when his boss shared his position on the 1967 war.

Gabriel recalls his story with his boss:

I am listening to the news, he said you are supposed to be working, I said but the country I come from is at war. . . He said besides I always wanted the Arabs to lose anyway, so I was extremely upset when he said that, and I told him how ignorant he was.

Thus, Gabriel showed his anger and refusal when his boss was not sensitive to the fact that Gabriel was from a country that was taken by other people, and that his boss wished his people to be defeated, not being aware of what Gabriel and his people went through as refugees, instead his boss had assumptions about Arabs and he wanted them to be defeated by Israel. The matter made George speak up and show his anger towards his boss’ position, and consequently Gabriel lost his job defending and standing for his country and what he believed to be righteousness.

Gabriel was also dismayed at the current leadership of ACCESS (Arab American Community for Economic and Social Services). He was one of the founders of ACCESS, and was aspiring to see this organization advocating for Palestine and the Palestinian rights, however, the new leadership let him down when they removed Palestine from their agenda as they changed the direction of ACCESS, Gabriel explains:

Actually, ACCESS when they [new leadership] took over, they took it from that direction which is people’s direction into a corporate direction, we became a corporation and our board was appointed
international tragedy is really caused by Israel, the Jewish community and the other side can you have? God for their homeland through their life outside of their home.

All three participants showed resilience throughout their journey of displacement.

That irreparable damage we call it PTSD for military people, but they don't realize that PTSD for the victims the ones whose homes were bombed, the ones we raised we came here when one child gets killed or when woman gets attacked or something. But were doing that hundreds and thousands of times every day benhabet el beitalahem, bnoqtolahelhom, bnakhodhomenbomthohol bel habes[speaking Arabic: destroy their houses on their heads, kill them and their families, hold them as detainees] what is that insanity? We don't even think they are real human beings, because Americans never thought of other people as human beings.

Joe also was mad at the Israelis as he felt they were controlling his homeland, that when he went for a visit, he needed to go through them to visit his home country, he confirms:

You have these 19,20-year-old soldiers whatever you know they have this authority over me, you know, and she would stand there and say you have you ever been to Israel before… I said I was born here, what? I said: “I was born here.” And she would get the authority or somebody they take my passport and then go in another room and make me wait hours. I get so angry with them. This anger extended to when he thinks about why he was not able to live in his home country, and how Israel is wrong in terms of justifying their control of his home country, Joe tells angrily:

There’s no two sides to Palestine. Palestine was stolen. And the people are being imprisoned in their own homes if they have a home; their homes are being demolished. What other side can you have? God gave us this land. What? We are the chosen people. What? We are the chosen people.

Narrative Analysis in a Broader Context

The Palestinians have been suffering from a capitalist and colonial system that places itself in a higher class due to religious and ethnic reasoning, and thus inflicts harm on what it considers an inferior class. Such a class keeps the Palestinians without choices, very poor and subject to policies designed to eventually expel the remaining people from the land. The effect of this expulsion from their homeland on their lives is immense. Their experiences of being refugees reflect such an impact. For example, in the three narratives of Gabriel, Joe and Eva, all three of them faced enormous challenges to get through their life and suffer of each Nhất của the displaced Palestinians and their history. All three participants showed resilience throughout their journey of displacement. From my own perspective, I anticipate that they all live up till this moment due to their resilience and activism for their homeland.

While in exile, all of participants in this study were positively active and represented their homeland as the main part of their identity. This was clear through their activities, situations with people and work environment. They all showed a sense of patriotism for their homeland through their life outside of their home country. Bader (2006) explained that patriotism could be positive or negative; yet, in both cases it fulfills psychological needs of people. Such needs are important for survival and safety. The FBI hunted two of the participants, Gabriel and Joe, for their patriotism, which shows connection between belonging and suffering to survive. This is an alarm of policies and regulations that contribute to make the refugees’ life more challenging.

The degree of suffering for each of the participants differed from one person to another, but they were concentrated on images from their homeland, escaping with their lives, and while in exile areas of making a living, surviving, and seeking education. Warriner (2007) associated being a refugee with continuous challenges, such challenges include access to education, like the case with Gabriel when he was not allowed to start pre-medicine. Warriner (2007) also indicated challenges of “accessing social and economic opportunities,” which eventually lead to concerns on “voice” (p. 344), this is true when the FBI investigated Joe and Gabriel after they leaked their voice to advocate for their country.

Now when illustrating voice in the three narratives of the Palestinian refugees, it is noticeable that the
three of them unleashed their voices through their support of their homeland. Joe participated in many activities such as fundraising for Palestine, Gabriel established organizations to support Palestine, and Eva has programs on TV. Yet, their voices were challenged when the FBI investigated Gabriel and Joe. While many refugees in the U.S. are placed in a position where they question their identity (Warriner, 2007), the three Palestinian refugees showed clearly their identity as Palestinians.

Both Gabriel and Joe showed anger towards organizations and government. This anger places mistrust in the way the organizations and the government function. How can someone belong to a place where the trust is lost? The anger both showed in their stories and narratives demonstrated their values of human rights and justice. As Ross (2011) described that mistrust is produced by interaction between a person and a place, which creates isolation and alienation, nevertheless, in the case of the participants, despite the fact that they did not trust the government and the organizations and were upset with them, they remained advocates and involved in activities and relationship with people. That gives them a sense of power and resilience.

**Positionality and Self-reflexivity**

The experience of hunting people for interviews for this study has been mixed with ambivalent feelings, unlike conducting the interviews that went very smoothly. I knew many Palestinians here in Michigan, yet the mission of finding my participants, although the required number was three, was daunting. Not many people are willing to be interviewed, I have contacted some Palestinians and they were not interested in being part of this study. Most of them did not explain why. I tried to tell him that it is very noisy, and I was afraid the recorded audio would not be clear for me to listen to it again, but he insisted on conducting the interview at the cafeteria of Ikea. Thus, I had to accommodate my participants’ requests and meet with them where they felt comfortable.

As for the second prospect I found, she was a professor, and she asked for a meeting with me before she would decide whether to do the interview or not. I drove 30 minutes to get to her house; she spoke about her story as a refugee for an hour and a half but did not allow me to record. I tried to interrupt her many times trying to convince her that I needed to record, but she refused. Eventually, she asked if I read any of her work, my answer was no. She surprised me by saying that I should have read more about her and her publications before coming to her house, and that I could find other people with whom to do the interview, because she did not see herself as a subject in a small study.

Unlike the second prospect, Joe, who is a participant in this study, sent me his home address and we met two days after I had given him a call. He was very flexible and very modest. In conclusion, this project, although it placed me under tremendous stress, trained me to be more patient, listen more than I speak, control my feelings at times of anger, accept what was put of my control such as the attitudes of prospects, and try to understand the other sides, so the experience was rich and eye-opening.
References